



“ . . . genuine science . . . ‘the-totality-of-the-information-concerning-the-special-question-thoroughly-cognized-by-perfected Reason’ . . .”<sup>1</sup>  
G. I. Gurdjieff

“Only when we leave ourselves out of it and serve the process can we become masters. We become true masters by making ourselves slaves but when we try to become masters we become slaves. If we use our creative power for ourselves it destroys us. If we sacrifice ourselves in order to serve the creative power, then it creates us.”<sup>11</sup> J. G. Bennett

“ . . . Beelzebub himself had to sweat to understand what he already knew.”<sup>111</sup> A. R. Orage

CHAPTER 8  
THE 'TRUE' AND THE 'SORRY' SCIENTIST

---

Throughout *Beelzebub's Tales*, Gurdjieff places repeated emphasis on “objective science,” the “true scientist,” and “the sorry scientist of new formation.” There are, additionally, “maleficent fantastic sciences,” “normal sciences,” “genuine sciences,” “Hasnamussian sciences,” “exact-positive-science” and “‘various wiseacrings’—that they call ‘sciences.’” A number of individual scientists play greater or lesser roles in *The Tales*, including the Akhaldanharnosovors, Algamatant, Chai-Yoo, Choon-Kil-tez and Choon-Tro-Pel, Gornahoor Harharkh and Gornahoor Rakhoorkh, Makary Kronbernkzion, Malmanash, Mesmer, Theophany, Pooloodjistius, Pythagoras and Hadji-Asvatz-Troov.

Given these varied and sometimes contradictory images and person-ages, it may not be readily apparent just what it is that characterizes the ‘true’ and the ‘sorry’ scientist. To come to a right and useful characterization would seem essential for people pursuing the Gurdjieff Work; as even the most superficial reading of the *Three Series* and *In Search of the Miraculous* leads one to the conclusion that Gurdjieff felt that true scientific pursuits were among the most essential aspects of living a real three-brained existence.

In the character of Hadji-Asvatz-Troov, Gurdjieff has offered many, if not all, of the essential clues as to what a true scientist would be. A true scientist would, first of all, be a true three-brained being. From the story Hadji-Asvatz-Troov shares about his earlier life, we would be led to conclude that he was a man of real, practical accomplishment. He had dealt with the material world, had honed many skills, had become very rich and “had in superabundance everything that our ordinary life can give.”<sup>1</sup>

Becoming wearied of the inevitable repetition of the same, for him, meaningless physical/material burden, he contemplated suicide. Only the memory of his still living mother and understanding the pain his suicide would cause her brought him to the awareness of the essential importance of the emotional world of right relationship. From that moment, “she became for me the source of my life.” His strength, his desire to live and “to do everything only that her life might flow agreeably for her,” was renewed whenever he remembered her dear face. Hadji-Asvatz-Troov’s capacity to be devoted to ‘Other’ (the real source of right relationship), became manifested and constant for the remaining ten years of his mother’s life.

Again, he is brought to near despair with her inevitable death. Now it is the wandering dervish who points him in the third direction, “there is only one way out for you—devote yourself to religion.” Hadji-Asvatz-Troov had proven his capacity to deal with the physical and material world, and had actualized the reality of the emotional world of devotion to ‘Other’. Withal, he came to realize that these two ‘worlds’ alone were incomplete and that, by themselves, they led only to a sense of the meaninglessness of his life. He had to move further in a new direction. By pursuing the higher concerns of the religious life, he entered the ‘monastic’ world wherein he would serve ‘Other’, both practically and emotionally, *and* share in the pursuit of higher meaning and purpose. The *physical* severity of the first brotherhood had not met his needs and had a ‘disillusioning effect’ on him, as did the second brotherhood he chose; (presumably) a brotherhood which emphasized the emotional or devotional aspect—an approach that he had already grown through, during the ten years of devotion to his mother. With his third choice, an order which appears to have included the physical/material and emotional, but which emphasized the intellectual and practical (“the Sheikh of which set me the *task* of devising that mechanical stringed musical instrument of which I have already spoken to you”), Hadji-Asvatz-Troov comes to the right balance of the three worlds of Being (Physical, Emotional, Intellectual).

Hadji-Asvatz-Troov does not stop at this level in the developmental movement through centers, but having fulfilled his responsible duties to the Sheikh and his brother monks, moves still further in his pursuit of knowledge of the Laws and eventually leaves the monastery with his friend Kerbalai-Azis-Nuaran, and retreats to the remarkable cave in Upper Bokhara.

1 BT, Chapter XV “The Bokharian Dervish Hadji-Asvatz-Troov,” P 895

This movement away from the monastery, to an even more remote, higher location, could be explored as an intimation of higher center connection and development. The movement through these five stages of development could also be explored as an individual actualization of the Five Strivings.

“The first striving: to have in their ordinary being-existence everything satisfying and really necessary for their planetary body.

“The second striving: to have a constant and unflagging instinctive need for self-perfection in the sense of being.

“The third: the conscious striving to know ever more and more concerning the laws of World-creation and World-maintenance.

“The fourth: the striving from the beginning of their existence to pay for their arising and their individuality as quickly as possible, in order afterwards to be free to lighten as much as possible the Sorrow of our COMMON FATHER.

“And the fifth: the striving always to assist the most rapid perfecting of other beings, both those similar to oneself and those of other forms, up to the degree of the sacred ‘Martfotai’ that is up to the degree of self-individuality.”<sup>2</sup>

This triad of developmental movement through the three brains appears to be an essential aspect of Gurdjieff’s view of the true scientist. He (the scientist) must first be balanced and harmonized in all three brains, and value equally the inner and outer worlds of man. While this attainment does not guarantee his success in scientific pursuits, it does establish a firm and balanced foundation in Being, which is essential for that pursuit.

By contrast, we could preliminarily infer that the sorry scientist lacks this harmony and development of Being, and thus has a narrowed horizon or skewed perspective on the three worlds (outer-physical, inner-emotional, and objective-intellectual). In the instance of Mesmer, the image of scientists of new formation *pecking to death* one who moved to broaden the possible horizons of investigation is an emphatic pointing to what is, in essence, a first brain/third brain (material/intellectual) *reaction* to an initial penetration into the reality of the second (inner or Emotional) brain. This lack of a real Emotional Center connection in man is further emphasized by Hadji-Asvatz-Troov’s demonstration, via the ‘vibrometer’, of the present state of man’s “subjective chord of vibrations.”

“It must be remarked that among men, especially men of recent times, very many are to be met with who have not even as great a number of vibrations in the subjective chord of vibrations of their common presence as the number shown by the presence of this dog.

2 *BT*, Chapter XXVII, “The Organization for Man’s Existence Created by the Very Saintly Ashiata Shiemash,” P 386

“This has come about because in most of these people I have just mentioned, one function for instance, and namely, the function of emotion, which actualizes the main quantity of subjective vibrations, is already almost completely atrophied, and therefore the sum total of vibrations in them proves to be less than in this dog.”<sup>3</sup>

The “sorry scientist of new formation” could then be defined as one whose function of *emotion* is “*almost completely atrophied*.” He may have a well trained intellectual part, but his ‘focus’ is on the material/physical world. He lacks a real “function of emotion,” which is that function which connects us, with *value-for*, to the world of ‘Other’, i.e., other three-brained beings, all other life forms, and the material world of mountains, oceans and air. It is this ‘emotional function’ which, when integrated with our other functions, makes possible a responsive and responsible life. The ‘null-value’ perspective, so much a part of western science’s view of itself, is an emotionless perspective. It sees and accepts no responsibility for its investigative pursuits or for the technological effluent of those pursuits. In this way, “our technology has greatly outdistanced our Being.”<sup>4</sup>



To return to the Bokharian Dervish model of the ‘true scientist’, Hadji-Asvatz-Troov’s level of Being is further defined by the following quotation:

“I had full moral right to tell him the truth about myself, because by his *attainments* he was already ‘Kalmanuioir,’ that is, a three-brained being of that planet with whom it is not forbidden us from Above to be frank.”

“This interdiction on the beings of our tribe was made chiefly because it is necessary for the three-brained beings of your planet to have ‘knowledge-of-being.’”<sup>5</sup>

Hadji-Asvatz-Troov had attained the required “knowledge-of-being” via the balanced three-brained existence which he had led. Further, the word ‘Kalmanuioir’ appears to be an adjectival form of ‘Kalman’, (which is derived from the Greek–*kalos*—meaning ‘good, beautiful’), the solar system in which the father of the captain of the Karnak became worthy to be promoted to the post of Ruler after his long years of blameless service to HIS ENDLESSNESS. Hence, this “good”, balanced man (Hadji-Asvatz-Troov), who had been of blameless service in the pursuit of his three-brained life, could be spoken to frankly concerning the nature of the higher worlds to which Beelzebub belonged. Hadji-Asvatz-Troov had come to this level

3 BT, P 904-5. Dog, a two-brained creature, has an emotional center-of-gravity.

4 A frequent comment by A. L. Staveley.

5 BT, PP 901-2 author’s italics

of attainment by his own effort, his own three-brained pursuit in spite of the difficulties and disappointments in his life.

To qualify as a "true scientist" it would appear that a three-brained being must have a practical understanding of the laws of the material, emotional and intellectual worlds and have the capacity (the inner unity of being) to bring all three into a balanced focus on questions of ordinary life as well as on questions that concern *right relationships, the understanding of laws, and the significance and purpose of life.*

#### APOLOGIA

What the modern sciences (both physical and biological) have brought, in terms of the understanding of *physical mechanism*, is a great treasure. One is rightfully awed by the astronomical views made possible by the Hubble telescope and by the patterns of DNA that form the genetic underpinning of all life. To ponder the mathematical unraveling of our Cosmos' material unfolding, or to trace the gradual development of man's three brains in evolutionary biology—each of these are pursuits to be greatly valued.

Each of these pursuits reveals *truth*, even though that truth is relative, and is directly applicable only to the material world. Gurdjieff himself made considerable use of the results of various sciences both in the more literal reporting of *In Search of the Miraculous* and in a more allegorical transmission throughout *Beelzebub's Tales*. Perhaps more essential and useful in our efforts to come to Being, is the fact that the *forms* of all law (the allowable patterns and sequences of the Laws of Three and Seven) are the same in the Inner and Objective worlds as they are in the Outer world. Coming to recognize and experience these patterns and sequences of Law, as Hadji-Asvatz-Troov did during the first three phases of his life, prepares one for real "Podobnisirnian" transmission.

---

CHAPTER 8, PAGE 106 ENDNOTES

I BT, P 841

II Bennett, *Talks on Beelzebub's Tales*, P 96

III Orage, P 36